
Dignity & Demand
5th of November, 2009

Welcoming Address – Philip O’Connor

The DEP together with the ICI developed the Dignity programme, which is in its first year and is now delivering its first set of results. This seminar links the ideas of dignity and demand, and links trafficking and prostitution which we see as part of a continuum. Dangers of categorising in terms of ‘puritan’ and ‘free’ and the changes in modern Ireland with the introduction of libertarianism.

Looking at the issue of prostitution itself, glibly referred to as the oldest profession, even in nineteenth century England, prostitutes were invariably the poorest members of society, common theme throughout history. Today, it is increasingly migrant, immigrant, women who are involved, and who are trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation. It is not a debate about Puritanism and libertarianism; it is about crime and our response to it.

Looking to provide structures for the women in these situations and how we can help them.

Opening Conference – Denise Charlton

Aim of the ICI is to provide for migrants who are at risk and our particular focus is migrant women who are trafficked.

As we have been developing our responses we have been working together with many of the partners represented in this room. We want to share some of the progressions that have been developed, resulting in a better service for victims of trafficking and increase awareness.

At the Global Conference Ban Ki Moon presented three challenges to the participants: economic recession; climate change; and the trafficking of women and girls, particularly for sexual exploitation. This is a threat, not only to these women, but to society as a whole.

How clever traffickers are at tricking women into these situations, and how we need to ensure greater protection for vulnerable women. The other issue that was urged is that individual countries cannot tackle this problem on their own, we are lucky to be able to look at the situation in other countries, Finland, Sweden, and we will learn from them. The funding from the EU enables us to work with our transnational partners and develop a truly international response to this problem.

Overview of Dignity Project – Gráinne Healy

Trying to develop an interagency initiative to respond to victims and provide services for them.

Internationally and globally there is increasing awareness that trafficking and prostitution go hand in hand, and it is now becoming difficult to talk about trafficking without mentioning prostitution.

If we want to prevent the continuation of this abuse we need to become as smart as the abusers. We need to learn from other countries that have had success in tackling this problem, in this regard we are lucky to have Jonas Trolle, from Sweden, who has been working at the forefront to reduce demand for prostitution.

The DEP is known to many people involved in Dublin. It is based on social partnership & was set up 1998 to find creative social employment solutions. The ICI is dedicated to providing services for trafficked women and is an Independent Law Centre.

Aim of project is look at the social context in different states, examine all elements of trafficking victims' experience and identify the best practices across the transnational partners. Year one is coming to an end but year two will involve more in depth visits and exchanges.

The partners will be publishing an end of year report with recommendations.

Rationale is that trafficking for sexual exploitation is an acknowledged criminal problem, and that the flourishing sex industry fuels the rising demand for trafficking.

Much of the research was conducted online, and while this is beneficial the internet also enables traffickers and exploiters, by registering in the UK, to advertise services in Ireland online, thereby making it harder to track.

We believe sincerely that the provision of services to VOT must go beyond harm reduction, the idea that one can treat an STD or an attack from a punter is acceptable but that should not be the end, tackling the demand is essential. The analysis that prostitution itself is a form of violence against women leads to a different model of service provision.

With the development of our own National Action Plan we have the 3 Ps: Prevention, Protection and Prosecution.

Sum up of the Dignity project: what it is, who is involved etc.

Sex Trafficking in Ireland – Monica O’Connor

Globalisation, Sex Trafficking and Prostitution – The Experiences of Migrant Women in Ireland. Research Ms O’Connor was involved in, commissioned by the ICI and HSE, Baggot Street.

Summary of the findings:

- 102 women identified over 21 month period
- Were aware of many other women and children
- 11% were children
- Extreme poverty
- Traffickers target their victims, working in the most obvious areas, poverty, war, violence, personal vulnerabilities, childhood abuse, cultural factors e.g. forced marriages
- Examined the tactics of traffickers
- Multiple methods used
- Movement across borders and within countries
- High level of control
- High debts, between €40,000 and €60,000
- Estimated at least 1,000 women involved in indoor prostitution at any one time, directly advertised on the internet
- Move towards indoor prostitution from outdoor prostitution during the 90s
- Ease with which it is possible to access prostitution in Ireland
- Strap-line that prostitution is illegal, we are not selling prostitution, we are selling the companionship of women
- 3-13% are Irish, remainder are migrant women
- Age range is 18-58, average age is 25
- Older women advertising anything
- Forms on which you can request a particular type of women
- Men who purchase sex are highly educated
 - Mostly married
 - 61% in a relationship
 - Also paid for women in street prostitution
 - A new site: www.punter.net where they happily discuss what women they have had, what street she was on etc, was she good, did she give a GFE etc
 - 54% visit pornographic sites
 - Vast majority are Irish and white
- Women’s experience:
 - A friend offered to pay flight
 - Told her she had contacts with clubs
 - Arrived in Ireland with debt
 - Moved around the place, no longer than 3 nights in any one location

DIGNITY
*An interagency initiative working to
deliver quality services for victims
of sex-trafficking in Ireland*

Dublin Employment Pact
Strand House (1st Floor), 22 Great Strand St., Dublin 1
Tel: +353-1-8788900
Email: info@dublinpact.ie
Website: www.dublinpact.ie

- Offered cocaine and alcohol to deal
- Not paid for first 6 weeks, so ending up further in debt
- Health impacts ó pressure not to use condoms
- Different tactics: violence, coercion, deception and enticement (Hollywood experience, promising these girls entertainment jobs, women go with these people willingly)
- It is the same intention regardless of the tactic used, it is one of exploitation and harm
- If we don't tackle demand we will always have women at harm

Overview of the Transnational Partners:

Ann Hamilton, Glasgow Community & Safety Services, Glasgow City Council

Glasgow is the largest city in Scotland, has been working on the issue of prostitution for 10-11 years now.

The way you see an issue determine how you will tackle it.

- Holistic approach
- First looked at street prostitution
- Move towards indoor prostitution
- Led to establishment of Tara Project
- Key elements:
 - An effective interagency partnership
 - Having people signed up to deliver services, police HSE, NGOs etc
 - Ensuring a quality, holistic, individual approach
 - Non-judgemental approach
 - A need to prioritise prevention
 - The earlier you can intervene or prevent women entering the industry the better
 - Tackling Demand is a major issue
 - Wanting to adopt the Swedish model to prevent the harm to women, families and communities.

Belen Garcia, AE Madrid & representing partner APRAMP

Three years ago the EA engaged with APRAMP to tackle prostitution, and provide employment for the women so as to get them out of prostitution.

- Developing workshops
- Training programmes with employment experience
- Labour programme allows the women to earn €900 per month

Vytautė Grybauskaitė, Klaipeda Social & Psychological Services Centre

DIGNITY is a joint project of Dublin
Employment Pact and the
Immigrant Council of Ireland
under the EU Daphne Programme.



- Rehabilitation and reintegration programme to assist women in reintegrating into society
- Support for women victims of domestic violence
- Mainly based on volunteer work
- Widespread partnership across many levels of society
- Perspective of Lithuania as a country of origin and of internal trafficking

Jane Pillinger, Dignity Project Research Overview & Interim Report

Key lessons from year 1

- Ongoing process of reflection
- Evidence of what works
 - Interagency approaches
 - Service provision
- Reinforced the absolute critical need for cooperation
- Information sharing, both intra and inter-country
- Respect for the positions of the different partners
- The developing of joint approaches
- Inspiration of new ideas
- Can help to validate and verify ideas and plans already underway
- Looking at international best practice
- Looking at best practice models identified through the Nordic Baltic Network
- Notion of "challenging"
- Immediate support services necessary when first identified as a VOT
- One of the lessons learned by the Irish partners is that unless there are effective processes and procedures in place the lessons learned will be lost unless down on paper
- Looking at a possible model of victim identification
 - Looking for a more flexible system and with a lower threshold
- Effective mechanism for referral
- Coordinated approach, learning lessons from our transnational partners
- Working model plan (Insert file)

KEYNOTE SPEAKER - *Detective Inspector Jonas Trolle, Stockholm Police*

- THB unknown phenomenon in Sweden until early 90s
- First cases involved Czech Republic, the Baltic States and Russia
- Not a big problem, but important
- If we hadn't dealt with the problem as we have it would have been bigger
- Every case has involved organised crime
- Detectives travel all over the world to build cases
- THB is multifaceted, also involves:

DIGNITY
*An interagency initiative working to
deliver quality services for victims
of sex-trafficking in Ireland*

Dublin Employment Pact
Strand House (1st Floor), 22 Great Strand St., Dublin 1
Tel: +353-1-8788900
Email: info@dublinpact.ie
Website: www.dublinpact.ie

- Narcotics
- weapons
- Prostitution
- Smuggling
- Blackmail
- Receiving
- Wave of thefts
- Priorities are to identify victims, prevent prostitution and ensure prosecution
- Method:
 - Pre-surveillance
 - Surveillance
 - Investigation
 - Getting the investigation ready for prosecution
- Victims often speak different languages, requiring translation services
- A lot of phone calls ó in one case 55,000 phone calls need to be analysed
- 2-4,000 pages of notes presented to the court
- Sufficient budget

Legislation

- Purchase of sexual service ó results in a day fine and up to six months in prison
- Procuring ó 14 day to 4 years
- Gross procuring ó 2-8 years
- Trafficking in human bodies ó 2-10 years
- Average punishment ó 3-5 years

Customer

- It is illegal to purchase sex but not to sell it
- It is never a question when talking about prostitution
- One out of 14 have purchased sex at least once, compared with one in eight during the 90s
- Typically married, all age groups, social classes
- It is an issue of power

The Organisers

- Using the girls dysfunctional backgrounds against them
- Holding them in invisible prisons
- Traffickers see themselves as good people, helping these girls, providing a service
- They often rape victims to test them

The Women

- Difficult backgrounds
- 75-80% of victims have been sexually abuse by a male relative or close friend (in Jonasøexperience it is closer to 100%)

DIGNITY
*An interagency initiative working to
deliver quality services for victims
of sex-trafficking in Ireland*

Dublin Employment Pact
Strand House (1st Floor), 22 Great Strand St., Dublin 1
Tel: +353-1-8788900
Email: info@dublinpact.ie
Website: www.dublinpact.ie

- Not voluntarily
- Prostitution = trafficking
- Don't know how they will be treated
- Don't know the number of customer
- Can't choose their customers
- Can't go back home whenever you want

There is a requirement for good relationships with other service providers, especially with

- Police (border control, drugs unit)
- Prosecutors
- Social services
 - One employee in the office works with Stockholm social services, kept in the loop for all cases
- Other public authorities
- NGOs
- Needs to learn which organisations to work with

Street Prostitution vs Internet Prostitution

- Most activities are over the internet ó hidden prostitution
- This is not a consequence of the Swedish legislation, rather it is a consequence of the internet
- Street prostitution still exists in Sweden, but it is decreasing

Allegations re the legislation

- That it has resulted in an increase in the number of rapes = False
- That it makes prostitution less safe = False, prostitution is always unsafe

Conclusions

- It is possible to fight trafficking in human bodies
- Start with the buyers
- Prostitution and trafficking in human bodies are a part of organised crime
- No one goes into prostitution voluntarily, it is a form of modern slavery
- Need to be faster at dealing with problem
- Need similar legislation in Europe to successfully tackle the problem

+ 46 8 401 03 81

jonas.trolle@polisen.se

*Response Safety & Policing; Learning from Glasgow
Ann Hamilton, Glasgow Community & Safety Services*

- Prostitution and trafficking fitting in with definition of violence against women

DIGNITY is a joint project of Dublin
Employment Pact and the
Immigrant Council of Ireland
under the EU Daphne Programme.



Immigrant Council
of Ireland



www.dublinpact.ie

www.immigrantcouncil.ie

DIGNITY
*An interagency initiative working to
deliver quality services for victims
of sex-trafficking in Ireland*

Dublin Employment Pact
Strand House (1st Floor), 22 Great Strand St., Dublin 1
Tel: +353-1-8788900
Email: info@dublinpact.ie
Website: www.dublinpact.ie

-
- Scottish Government adopting this view
 - Policy adopted in 1999

Glasgow's Commercial Sexual Exploitation Policy

- Significant social problem in Glasgow which affects women
- Rejects the view of worker choice
- Survival behaviour
- The only free choice is that of the purchaser, who decides when, where and how he will buy
- Caused by, and perpetuates, gender inequality
- Violence against women

It is hard to say to politicians that we don't have a quick fix; that we are in this for the long haul

- Very high priority = violence and violence against women
- Medium priority = commercial sexual exploitation
 - Only because of the small number of women affected

Scale of the sex industry

- Estimated 130 women in street prostitution in Glasgow
- 1700-5,300 premises in the UK
- 6,000-18,000 women in off street prostitution in the UK
- Generates between £450 million and £1.75 billion each year
- ACPOS estimates that Scotland had 13.5% of UK human trafficking trade although it only accounts for 10% of crime figures
- Has a service in Glasgow for men and boys involved in prostitution

Glasgow Saunas website, 2001

- Established in 1967
- Top parlour in Glasgow
- Security and peace of mind are critical which is why every member of staff is bonded
- 35 ladies at any given time, ensuring you a fabulous variety from day to day
- Choose from Spanish, Italian, Thai, black, white, Russian plus lots, lots more

Punter Reviews

- Quotes ó horrific

Men are buying sex because of peer pressure. This is what has been changed in Sweden, AH is keen to see this in Glasgow.

Evidence of impact on women

DIGNITY is a joint project of Dublin Employment Pact and the Immigrant Council of Ireland under the EU Daphne Programme.



Immigrant Council
of Ireland



www.dublinpact.ie

www.immigrantcouncil.ie

DIGNITY
**An interagency initiative working to
deliver quality services for victims
of sex-trafficking in Ireland**

Dublin Employment Pact
Strand House (1st Floor), 22 Great Strand St., Dublin 1
Tel: +353-1-8788900
Email: info@dublinpact.ie
Website: www.dublinpact.ie

-
- Physical harm
 - Emotional and psychological harm
 - Stigma and shame
 - Isolated and scared
 - Rejected by family/community
 - Vulnerable to targeting/blackmail
 - Post-traumatic stress
 - Over 95% want to leave the industry

Established Tara in 2004 to deal with the women and provide services

- 2005: 2 referrals
- 2006: 9 referrals
- 2007: 14 referrals
- 2008: 3 referrals
- 2009: 50 so far

The issue of internal trafficking and moving from Glasgow to Dublin was also raised.

Unless we can stem the flow of this we will continue to spend money on treating the symptoms. Quote from Jonas Trolle.

Spoke about the legalisation of prostitution => disagreed with this, the nature of prostitution is that it is damaging

Current and Planned Action

- Lap-dancing clubs are currently licensed in a similar way to karaoke bars
- GCC policy has been updated to include all forms of commercial sexual exploitation
- About to launch campaign lobbying Parliament for Swedish style law
- www.endprostitutionnow.org

Irish Policing Approaches
Detective Superintendent Noel Clarke, Garda National Immigration Bureau

Focused on trafficking element

Victim Identification

- Various international instruments
- VOT will have access to a number of services and provisions that normal victims wont have
- A child is defined as anyone under 18
- There are numerous international definitions
 - Trafficking elements

DIGNITY
**An interagency initiative working to
deliver quality services for victims
of sex-trafficking in Ireland**

Dublin Employment Pact
Strand House (1st Floor), 22 Great Strand St., Dublin 1
Tel: +353-1-8788900
Email: info@dublinpact.ie
Website: www.dublinpact.ie

- Exploitation
- Coercion/force ó cannot consent to this
- A child can never consent
- Draft Framework Decision is under discussion at the Justice and Home Affairs Council Meeting
- The primary function of GNIB is to gather evidence
- Emphasised the importance of adherence to procedure
- When the age of the victim is uncertain they will err on the side of caution and presume to be a child

UNGIFT ó UN Global Initiative to Fight Trafficking

- ÆBlue blindfoldøcampaign
 - Allows people to anonymously pass information, useful tool
- If there are immigration issues they are secondary to that of Ævictim of crimeø
- Ways of knowing if someone is Æcontrolledø
 - Someone else speaks for them
 - Bonded
 - Juju/black magic bonds
 - Looks intimidated
- Importance of developing an understanding of the victim

Delphi Study

- Limited testing
- Overall, cumbersome
- Using all available indicators from both UNGIFT and Delphi

Administrative Arrangements

- Published November last year
- If reasonable grounds exists, as identified by Garda not below rank of superintendent

Role of NGOs

- While there is no state role for NGOs in identification process many referrals come from NGOs
- We ask for as much information as possible from the NGO => moral and personal quandary for NGOs

Reasonable Grounds

- Access to services automatically, we don't wait until status as VOT has been confirmed
- IOM: assessment of the range of indicators, then an interview occurs
- Reasserts the view that his role is to gather evidence

Investigation

- There to provide assistance and advice to investigations
- Some done locally
- Advent of CAB means that we have good processes to take money off organised crime
- Traffickers unlikely to move from countries where prostitution has been criminalised, like Sweden, to Ireland because of CAB

Political Responses to Trafficking, Prostitution & Curbing Demand

Deputy Denis Naughten, Fine Gael

- FG was the first party to appoint a shadow spokesperson for Immigration & Integration
- Many people going home, this raises new issues
- The issue of accommodation for victims and suspected VOT
- Issue of child trafficking
- We should acknowledge that the Human Trafficking legislation was a huge step forward in criminalising the purchaser and saying that the victim isn't guilty of a crime
- The identification of victims is an issue
- Hopes the plan introduced during the summer helps to clarify things
- To date Ireland hasn't officially identified any VOT
- Up to June 2009:
 - 151 investigations into claims of trafficking
 - 65 into identified trafficked measures
 - 4 people have been granted R&R period
- We need to view these victims not as illegal immigrants but as people who have been exploited
- Need to find a balance between so few people being granted R&R and granting it to everyone
- It is important we don't purely look at it from the point of view of criminal law
- FG has called on the Government to use the debate on the Immigration, Residence and Protection Bill to raise these issues
- We cannot accept the housing of VOT in RIA centres
 - This leads to further exploitation/grooming
- The Department of Justice and the Government believe that over 70% of all victims are children in the care of the HSE or Asylum Seekers
- Galway RCC have stated that 1 in 5 victims who go to them are Asylum Seekers, despite being only 1% of the population in Galway
- Need for appropriate accommodation
- Current system doesn't help convictions
- Attitudinal change to laws on prostitution is necessary, happened in Sweden

DIGNITY
*An interagency initiative working to
deliver quality services for victims
of sex-trafficking in Ireland*

Dublin Employment Pact
Strand House (1st Floor), 22 Great Strand St., Dublin 1
Tel: +353-1-8788900
Email: info@dublinpact.ie
Website: www.dublinpact.ie

- It is vital we do the same
- Amsterdam is reducing their Red Light District
- Commented on the Scottish campaign
- UK purchase and knowledge, it will be a criminal offence to purchase from trafficked women, ignorance of the fact that she was trafficked will not be a defence
- We need to change our laws so that we do not become the red light district of Europe
 - With cheap flights it will be easy for people to come here
- US report in 2007: arrest reduced demand of future prostitution by 70%
- Attitudinal change of we need to make prostitution and the use of prostitutes not socially acceptable
- It is a problem in every part of Ireland, even Roscommon-South Leitrim
- Spoke about his Private Members Motion
- Wants to see:
 - No RIA
 - Adequate R&R
 - Establishment of a High-level group to examine prostitution legislation and come up with solutions, it is important to address the issue before it gets out of hand

Issue of Children

- Figures from HSE: 503 children have went missing from HSE care centres since 2003
- 36 are still unaccounted for, no one knows where they are
- US State Department Report, 2009:
 - Irish Government reported to them that a small number of children have later been found in domestic servitude and exploitative labour situations
- Trafficked children have a number of problems:
 - Language barriers
 - Exploited
 - Hope for a better future
- Ireland must end the practice of housing unaccompanied minors in hostels
 - The publication of the Ryan Report pledges to do this by the end of December 2010
 - 80 children will have went missing by then

Kirsi Hanifin **Women and Equality Officer, Labour**

Labour Women have taken the initiative in this area

- Labour Party launched a Violence Against Women policy document in 2006

DIGNITY is a joint project of Dublin
Employment Pact and the
Immigrant Council of Ireland
under the EU Daphne Programme.



Immigrant Council
of Ireland



www.dublinpact.ie

www.immigrantcouncil.ie

- Dealt with:
 - Domestic violence
 - Rape and sexual assault
 - Prostitution
 - Pornography
- Labour Party recommended that we look at the Swedish model
 - Needs to be debated in the Dáil
- Pat Rabbitt has spoken on the issue of prostitution in Sligo, Cork and Kilkenny
- Victim protection is an issue needing to be incorporated
- Launch of Women in Politics (Report of the Sub-Committee)
 - Increase of women representative means it will be easier to get these issues raised in future

Questions and Answers/Comments

Stellan Hermansson

Global Solidarity Officer, ICTU (personal capacity)

- It is important to know that support among Swedish people for the legislation has increased in the 10 years since it was passed
- The main goal isn't to punish men who buy sex but to change norms
- Argument against criminalisation you are likely to encounter: it is the oldest profession, but the length of a profession doesn't legitimise it (slavery), additionally, the oldest profession was midwifery

Marion Walsh

AHTU

- Question for Mr Trolle, re: 4-600 women

Triona Ni Giolla Choille

Galway Refugee Support Group

- Refugees and asylum seekers are a particularly vulnerable group
- Heartened by the Swedish model and the widespread acceptance
- Also by Ann Hamilton by the idea of a public body working on an issue
- Queries what is happening outside of Dublin, similar issues are being faced but often with less resources
- Wants that Dignity would use its second year to look at the rest of the country

Jonas Trolle

- It is estimated that there are 4-600 trafficked women working in Sweden, this is based on our cases and that we can 5-10% of people in trafficked situations

-
- Cannot compare with pre-1999 as trafficking in Sweden was unknown, therefore there are no figures

Gráinne Healy

- Model of services, we do have an understanding that many services are Dublin-based
- The idea is to get a model from Dublin and promote the mainstreaming of this and the links with statutory bodies throughout the country.
- Trafficking is a problem which require a national response

Closing Comments – Sr Stanislaus Kennedy

- Topic of huge importance in Ireland today
- Became clear over the past two years that if we are serious about tackling trafficking and prostitution we must fight Demand and criminalise the purchase of sex
- It is a difficult fight, but it is possible if we get the public behind us
- While it is true that only a minority of women involved in the sex industry are trafficked and while some women choose it we must still work towards its abolition
- Monica O'Connor spoke of the harm to women's bodies and minds
- It is common sense that no one would choose this
- Horrific damage should not be considered an acceptable price to be paid by women trapped in these situations
- Hopes Ireland will be able to put in place policies and services based on best international practice.